Dichlorocarbene modified graphene oxide nanocomposite fabricated by a facile hydrothermal method and its adsorption properties toward rare earth elements


*Corresponding author.

Abstract

Dichlorocarbene modified graphene oxide (GO-CCl₂) was prepared via a facile hydrothermal method by using GO as the substrate material. The morphology and chemical compositions of the as-prepared material were characterized by Fourier transform infrared (FT-IR) spectroscopy, Raman spectroscopy, thermogravimetric analysis and field emission scanning electron microscopy (FE-SEM). Additionally, the material was used to adsorb five kinds of rare earth elements (REEs), including La(III), Y(III), Yb(III), Er(III) and Nd(III) from aqueous solutions, and the adsorption kinetics and thermodynamics of GO-CCl₂ for Yb(III) were investigated in detail. The GO-CCl₂ was also applied to remove REEs from real water samples including spring water, Xiangjiang River, Yudai River and tap water, and the results showed that GO-CCl₂ owned relatively high stability and satisfactory adsorption capacity in complicated natural water system, and the highest removal rates reached to 100% for La(III) and >90% for other REEs in tap water. Therefore, it is proposed that GO-CCl₂ can be used to remove REEs from aqueous solutions.

Keywords: Graphene oxide; Dichlorocarbene; Rare earth elements; Adsorption; Hydrothermal assisted synthesis

1. Introduction

Rare earth elements (REEs) are widely distributed in the earth's crust, which have played a crucial role in many application fields, including catalysis, hydrogen storage, luminescence, magnetic ceramics and so on [1]. Owing to the high demand and consumption for REEs in various industries, the exploitation methods were continuously improved and optimized. The total global reserves of REEs represented a dramatic decrease in the past decades due to the excessive exploration to meet the needs of economic and scientific development, which has eventually attracted great attention from the government [2,3]. During mining, smelting- and separating procedures, it is very likely to discharge REEs into soil, air and water. It is worth noting that REEs distributions in some rocks and associated minerals have...
been discharged into water systems and contributed a lot to water pollution [4]. However, even trace amount of REEs in the environment would cause serious consequences for animal and human health. For example, trace Gd(III) ion may result in abnormal proliferation of cervical carcinoma cells-HeLa cells in human body [5]. Hence, the maximum degree of REEs in wastewater should be controlled. And the recovery of REEs also becomes necessary due to the constantly escalating future needs of such crucial and limited natural resources. The discharged REEs can be regenerated from contaminated water, and the environmental pollution would also be reduced. Despite several separation and enrichment methods such as precipitation, solvent extraction, ion exchange, liquid membrane extraction and so on, adsorption still counts for a lot for the recovery REEs [6–9]. Traditional adsorbents including activated carbon, by-pass cement dust, γ-Al₂O₃, bacterial cell walls and clay minerals, have been applied in the adsorption of REEs in the past [10–13]. However, the development of efficient, promising and feasible adsorbents for the recycling of REEs was still a challenge [14].

As an emerging and potential nanomaterial, graphene was discovered and characterized in 2004 by Novoselov et al. [16], which has attracted much attention by many scholars in recent years [15,17–20]. Due to the hexagonal lattice structure of graphene alignment, graphene-based materials displayed many special properties such as superior electron mobility, thermal conductivity, excellent optical and mechanical properties [21–25]. One of the graphene derivatives, graphene oxide (GO), possesses plentiful oxygen-rich functional groups containing epoxy, hydroxyl and carboxyl groups which provide a large number of binding sites [26–29]. GO is also highly hydrophilic and could be homogeneously dispersed in water [30–32]. The large theoretical surface area of GO is beneficial when it is fully contact with targeted adsorbates such as dyes, heavy metal ions, REEs and phenols. However, the lack of other functional groups, especially hydrophobic groups, would generate strong inter planar interaction among GO layers and affect the whole adsorption efficiency [33]. Up to now, many research studies on GO composites have been implemented, indicating that appropriate modifications of GO can overcome the above-mentioned shortcomings [34–37]. For instance, a porous hydrogel nanocomposite composed of chitosan-poly(acrylic acid) (CS-PAA) and GO showed satisfactory lead ions (Pb(II)) removal [38], and nitrogen-containing amino (NA) modified GO showed selective adsorption capability for copper ions (Cu(II)) and Pb(II) [39]. The preparation and application of dihalocarbonates including dichlorocarbene (–CCl₂), dibromocarbene (–CBr₂) and diiodocarbene (–CI₂) modified carbon nanomaterials seems to be feasible. For example, –CI₂ modified reduced multiple-walled carbon nanotubes (MWCNTs–Cl₂) showed satisfactory adsorption ability toward Pb(II) than as-received MWCNTs due to the additional coordination interactions between –I and Pb(II) [40]. And –CBr₂ functionalized reduced GO (RGO-CBr₂) possessed much higher adsorption capacities toward Pb(II) than that of as-received RGO, indicating that the coordination interactions between halogen atoms and metal ions are beneficial to the highly efficient adsorption of metal ions [41]. Additionally, the oxygen-containing groups are also helpful for increasing the equilibrium adsorption capacity of an adsorbent [42].

To achieve more efficient aqueous adsorption of REEs, dichlorocarbene modified GO (GO–CCl₂) nanocomposite was fabricated through a facile hydrothermal method (Fig. 1), and its adsorption properties were evaluated. To the best of our knowledge, this is the first attempt for attaching dichlorocarbene onto GO by a facile hydrothermal method. The newly developed graphene-based adsorbent possessed both abundant oxygen-containing and halogen groups, and its application on adsorption of REEs from aqueous solutions was evaluated and discussed.

2. Experimental details
2.1. Materials

Flake graphite as a raw material was supplied by Tianjin Kermel Chemical Reagent Development Center (Tianjin, China) with higher purity of >99.85%. And potassium permanganate (KMnO₄), phosphoric acid (H₃PO₄), sulfuric acid (H₂SO₄), hydrochloric acid (HCl), benzyl triethyl ammonium chloride (TEBA) and hydrogen peroxide (H₂O₂) were all obtained from Sinopharm Chemical Reagent Beijing Co., Ltd. (Shanghai, China). Chloroform (CHCl₃) was bought from Tianjin Zhiyuan Chemical Reagent Co., Ltd. (Tianjin, China). All reagents were of analytical grade and used with no further purification. Ytterbium chloride hexahydrate...
(YbCl₃·6H₂O; 99.99 wt.%), lanthanum chloride heptahydrate (LaCl₃·7H₂O; 9.99 wt.%), erbium chloride hexahydrate (ErCl₃·6H₂O; 99.90 wt.%), yttrium chloride heptahydrate (YCl₃·7H₂O; 99.90 wt.%) and neodymium chloride hexahydrate (NdCl₃·6H₂O; 99.90 wt.%). The real water samples were acquired from the district of Changsha, Hunan province, China.

2.2. Characterization methods

The characteristic functional groups of GO-CCl₂ composite were revealed using Fourier transform infrared (FT-IR) spectroscopy in the wavenumber range 400–4,000 cm⁻¹ on a Nicolet 6700 FT-IR spectrometer (Thermo Nicolet Corp., Madison, WI) with pure potassium bromide (KBr) as the background. Raman spectra of GO and GO-CCl₂ composite was measured using a LabRAM HR800 micro-Raman spectrometer (JY Inc., Edison, NJ). Thermogravimetric analysis (TGA) was carried out on a SDT Q600 V8.0 Build 95 thermal analyzer apparatus (Netzsch, Germany) at a heating rate of 10°C min⁻¹ in argon (Ar) atmosphere. Moreover, the surface morphologies of as-prepared GO-CCl₂ material were investigated by a MIRA3 TESCAN field emission scanning electron microscopy (FE-SEM; TESCAN, Czech Republic).

2.3. Preparation of GO-CCl₂ composite

GO was prepared by improved Hummers’ method reported previously [43–45]. A mixture of flake graphite (300 mg) and KMnO₄ powder (1.50 g) was added into a round-bottom flask, and a mixed acid of concentrated H₃PO₄ and H₂SO₄ (40 mL; V/V = 9:1) was added dropwise into the reaction. After being stirred at 50°C for 12 h, the mixture was cooled to room temperature and diluted with 40.0 mL of ice water. Then 3.0 mL of H₂O₂ was added until no bubble appeared, and the solution turned bright yellow. Finally, the mixture was rinsed repeatedly with HCI (1 M) and ultrapure water for three times, GO suspension was obtained with a concentration of 5 mg mL⁻¹.

GO dispersion (10 mL), CHCl₃ (8 mL) and NaOH solution (1.0 g mL⁻¹, 8 mL) were mixed TEBA (10 mg), which was then was transferred into an autoclave and hydrothermally treated at 110°C for 2 h. After reaction, the excess alkali was neutralized by adding 1 M HCl. The mixture was filtered, rinsed with ethanol and ultrapure water for several times. The solid residue was dispersed in 10 mL of deionized water and freeze-dried to obtain GO-CCl₂ composite (58 mg).

2.4. Adsorption tests

Trivalent REE ion (REE³⁺) solutions including lanthanum (La³⁺), yttrium (Y³⁺), ytterbium (Yb³⁺), erbium (Er³⁺) and neodymium (Nd³⁺) were prepared by dissolving the corresponding chlorides in ultrapure water, respectively. The adsorption behavior of GO-CCl₂ composite toward La³⁺, Yb³⁺, Y³⁺, Er³⁺ and Nd³⁺ was investigated. In the typical batch experiments, 5 mg of the GO-CCl₂ adsorbents were added into 20 mL of above REE³⁺ solutions (40 mg L⁻¹) for a certain time (10–150 min), the residual REE³⁺ concentrations were determined by inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectroscopy (ICP-OES).

Yb³⁺ was selected as a “model” REE³⁺ to study the adsorption isotherms of GO-CCl₂ adsorbent. 5 mg of GO-CCl₂ was dispersed in 20 mL of Yb³⁺ solution (10, 20, 30, 40, 60 and 80 mg L⁻¹), which were then kept in oscillator at 25°C, 35°C and 45°C for 90 min. After adsorption, the remaining Yb³⁺ concentrations were detected by ICP-OES.

The recovery method was adopted to evaluate the adsorption properties of GO-CCl₂ adsorbent toward REE³⁺ in complex water systems including spring water, Xiangjiang River, Yudai River and tap water. By mixing 10.0 mg of GO-CCl₂ composite and 20.0 mL of La³⁺, Yb³⁺, Y³⁺, Er³⁺ and Nd³⁺ solution (20 mg L⁻¹), the removal rates and adsorption capacities of the adsorbent for the five REE³⁺ were studied.

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Characterization

The morphologies of GO and GO-CCl₂ were investigated by FE-SEM (Fig. 2). In comparison with GO (Fig. 2a),
more fragment layers and curly edges could be observed for GO-CCl$_2$ and the layers become rougher (Fig. 2b). Additionally, the GO-CCl$_2$ layer turns to be a little thicker owing to the increased layer to layer interactions due to the introduced chlorine groups.  

Besides SEM characterizations, several typical characterization methods including FT-IR spectroscopy, Raman spectroscopy and TGA were also employed to reveal the structural features of GO-CCl$_2$ composite. As shown in Fig. 3a, the absorbing peaks of main functional groups, such as O–H group, C–O group and so on, are observed obviously. The peak at 588.11 cm$^{-1}$ could be attributed to the C–Cl group of the prepared composite, demonstrating the attachment of dichlorocarbene onto the surface of GO. Moreover, the C=O peak shifts to the lower wavenumber due to the formed cyclopropane on the graphene sheet.  

As for Raman spectra, the D band and G band at 1,350 and 1,580 cm$^{-1}$ are associated with the vibration of sp$^3$ carbon atom of disorder and defect structure and the sp$^2$ carbon atom of graphitic hexagonal lattice, respectively. The relative intensity of D band and G band ($I_D/I_G$) for GO and GO-CCl$_2$ increased from 0.852 to 1.119, indicating the skeleton structure of graphene sheet was damaged a little due to the attachment of dichlorocarbene (Fig. 3b).  

The TGA curve of GO-CCl$_2$ is displayed in Fig. 3c. A three-step weight loss could be observed in the temperature range 30°C–1,000°C. The first weight loss below 200°C can be assigned to the evaporation of physically adsorbed water in the surface of the GO-CCl$_2$ composite; the second weight loss of about 18.0 wt.% between 200°C and 400°C might be due to the decomposition of oxygen functional groups; and the third weight loss above 400°C could be attributed to the thermal pyrolysis of cyclopropane structure. Therefore, it can be deduced that dichlorocarbene was successfully grafted onto GO.  

3.2. Kinetic studies  

The effect of contact time (0–150 min) on the adsorption efficiency of GO-CCl$_2$ composite for five kinds of REEs (La$^{3+}$, Yb$^{3+}$, Y$^{3+}$, Er$^{3+}$ and Nd$^{3+}$) was observed by performing experiments at 308 K (Fig. 4a). Obviously, a significant increase in its adsorption capacity during the first 15 min could be observed, and then the adsorption tended to slow down gradually within the next 60 min. The maximum adsorption capacity would be achieved in about 80 min. The adsorption data of GO-CCl$_2$ composite toward Yb$^{3+}$ were fitted by five kinetic models including pseudo-first-order kinetic model (Eq. (1)), pseudo-second-order kinetic model (Eq. (2)), Elovich model (Eq. (3)), Weber and Morris (W-M) model (Eq. (4)) and Bangham model (Eq. (5)) (Figs. 4b–f). These models are expressed as follows:

$$k_1 t = \frac{\ln q_e}{\ln(q_e - q_t)}$$ (1)  

$$\frac{1}{q_t} + \frac{1}{q_e} = \frac{1}{q_t^0} - \frac{1}{k_2 q_t^0} t$$ (2)
\begin{align*}
q_t &= \frac{1}{\beta} \left( \ln \alpha \beta \right) + \frac{1}{\beta} \ln t \\
q_t &= k_p t^{1/2} + C \\
\ln q_t &= \ln k_i + \frac{1}{m} \ln t
\end{align*}

where \( k_1 \) (1 min\(^{-1}\)) and \( k_2 \) (g mg\(^{-1}\) min\(^{-1}\)) are the rate constants of pseudo-first-order kinetic model and pseudo-second-order kinetic model; \( q_e \) (mg g\(^{-1}\)) and \( q_t \) (mg g\(^{-1}\)) are the adsorption quantity at equilibrium and time \( t \); \( \alpha \) (mmol g\(^{-1}\) min\(^{-1}\)) is the initial adsorption rate; \( \beta \) (g mmol\(^{-1}\)) is desorption constant; \( k_i \) (mg g\(^{-1}\) min\(^{-1/2}\)) is the intraparticle diffusion constant; while \( m \) and \( k_i \) are the relevant constants of Bangham model.

Fig. 4. Adsorption kinetics for REE\(^{3+}\) onto GO-CCl\(_2\) composite: (a) effects of contact time on the adsorption of La\(^{3+}\), Yb\(^{3+}\), Y\(^{3+}\), Er\(^{3+}\) and Nd\(^{3+}\) onto GO-CCl\(_2\) at 308 K. The kinetics data of GO-CCl\(_2\) composite for Yb\(^{3+}\) fitted to various models: (b) pseudo-first-order kinetic model, (c) pseudo-second-order kinetic model, (d) Elovich model, (e) Weber–Morris model and (f) Bangham model.
The kinetic parameters of the five models were calculated (Table 1). It is obvious that the adsorption of Yb\(^{3+}\) onto GO-CCl\(_2\) composite fitted better to pseudo-second-order kinetic model with a much higher coefficient of determination \(R^2\), indicating that the adsorption process was mainly determined by a chemical interaction. Chemical reactions between the electron-rich chlorine-containing/oxygen-containing groups and the unoccupied orbitals of REE\(^{3+}\) were significant as the rate-controlling steps in the adsorption [46].

### 3.3. Adsorption isotherms

In addition, the adsorption isotherms were also studied to reveal the effects of temperature on the adsorption behaviors (Fig. 5a). The initial concentrations of Yb\(^{3+}\) solutions were in the range of 10–80 mg L\(^{-1}\), and the adsorption temperatures were set as 298, 308 and 318 K. The adsorption capacities of GO-CCl\(_2\) composite for Yb\(^{3+}\) increased with an increase in contact temperature. The adsorption data were fitted by Langmuir (Eq. (6)), Freundlich (Eq. (7)) and Temkin (Eq. (8)) isotherm models which could be expressed as follows:

\[
\frac{C_e}{q_e} = \frac{1}{K_L q_m} + \frac{C_e}{q_m}
\]  

\[
\ln q_v = \ln K_f + \frac{1}{n} \ln C_e
\]  

\[
q_e = \frac{RT}{b_f} \ln C_e + \frac{RT}{b_f} \ln A_f
\]

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(k_1)</td>
<td>(q_e)</td>
<td>(R^2)</td>
<td>(k_2)</td>
<td>(q_e)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.0125</td>
<td>26.80</td>
<td>0.4339</td>
<td>0.0015</td>
<td>109.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 5. (a) Adsorption capacities of GO-CCl\(_2\) for Yb\(^{3+}\) at 298, 308 and 318 K; Yb\(^{3+}\) adsorption isotherms of GO-CCl\(_2\) composite: (b) Langmuir isotherm model, (c) Freundlich isotherm model and (d) Temkin isotherm model.
where \( q_e \) (mg g\(^{-1}\)) and \( q_m \) (mg g\(^{-1}\)) are the equilibrium adsorption capacity and maximum adsorption capacity; \( C_C \) (mg L\(^{-1}\)) is the equilibrium concentration of metal ions in solutions; \( K_L \) and \( K_F \) are Langmuir constant and physical constant of Freundlich isotherm, respectively; \( n \) is an empirical constant relating to adsorption intensity; while \( b_T \) is a physical quantity which is related with adsorption heat.

The isotherm parameters for the adsorption of Yb\(^{3+}\) by GO-CCl\(_2\) composite were fitted (Table 2). A higher correlation coefficient values (\( R^2 \)) represented that the adsorption of Yb\(^{3+}\) onto GO-CCl\(_2\) composite fitted better by Langmuir model than Freundlich and Temkin models (Figs. 5b–d), indicating that the chemical monolayer adsorption occurred on the as-prepared material. The maximum adsorption capacities of GO-CCl\(_2\) composite are about 70.225, 101.11 and 110.13 mg g\(^{-1}\) at 298, 308 and 318 K, respectively.

### 3.4. Thermodynamic study

The entropy changes (\( \Delta S^{\circ} \)), enthalpy changes (\( \Delta H^{\circ} \)) and standard free energy changes (\( \Delta G^{\circ} \)) were calculated according to the thermodynamic equations (Eqs. (9)–(11)):

\[
K_d = \frac{(C_0 - C_e)}{C_e} \times \frac{V}{m} \quad (9)
\]

\[
\ln K_d = \frac{\Delta H^{\circ}}{R} + \frac{\Delta S^{\circ}}{R} \quad (10)
\]

\[
\Delta G^{\circ} = \Delta H^{\circ} - T\Delta S^{\circ} \quad (11)
\]

where \( T \) (K) and \( K_d \) (L mg\(^{-1}\)) represent the absolute temperature and standard thermodynamic equilibrium constant; \( C_0 \) (mg L\(^{-1}\)) and \( C_e \) (mg L\(^{-1}\)) are the initial concentration and equilibrium concentration of Yb\(^{3+}\) solution, respectively; \( R \) (8.314 J mol\(^{-1}\) K\(^{-1}\)) means the gas constant.

The thermodynamic parameters for the adsorption of Yb\(^{3+}\) by GO-CCl\(_2\) composite were analyzed (Fig. 6; Table 3). From the positive values of \( \Delta H^{\circ} \) and \( \Delta S^{\circ} \), and negative value of \( \Delta G^{\circ} \), it can be deduced that the adsorption of Yb\(^{3+}\) by GO-CCl\(_2\) composite was a spontaneous and endothermic reaction. When the magnitude of \( \Delta H^{\circ} \) is 8–16 kJ mol\(^{-1}\), the adsorption type can be explained by chemical adsorption. Therefore, we could infer that the adsorption of Yb\(^{3+}\) onto GO-CCl\(_2\) composite can be defined as a chemical adsorption process (\( \Delta H^{\circ} = 17.78 \) kJ mol\(^{-1}\)) [47]. And the thermodynamic data were consistent with those obtained from adsorption isotherm and kinetic studies.

### 3.5. Adsorption mechanism

Normally, the oxygen-containing groups can interact with metal ions, making GO possess higher adsorption efficiency than that of reduced GO [48]. The metals including transition or main group species could also interact with halogen through coordination bond [49]. The introduced halogen bonds (–CCl\(_2\)) on to GO can provide additional interactions for REE\(^{3+}\), and GO-CCl\(_2\) possessed higher adsorption capacity than that of GO. Meanwhile, the adsorption capacities of GO-CX\(_2\) (X = F, Cl, Br or I) for REE\(^{3+}\) could be regulated by changing the halogen species because the strength and the possibilities of GO-CX\(_2\)M (M is metal) would change.

### 3.6. Evaluation of adsorption capacities in real samples

GO-CCl\(_2\) composite was applied to adsorb La\(^{3+}\), Y\(^{3+}\), Yb\(^{3+}\), Er\(^{3+}\) and Nd\(^{3+}\) in spring water, Xiangjiang river water, Yudai river water and tap water, respectively. No or little REE\(^{3+}\) ions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2</th>
<th>Isotherm parameters for the adsorption of Yb(^{3+})</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( T ) (K)</td>
<td>( b )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>298</td>
<td>–3.1786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>308</td>
<td>0.2867</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>318</td>
<td>0.2879</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3</th>
<th>Thermodynamic parameters for the adsorption of Yb(^{3+}) onto GO-CCl(_2) composite</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( T ) (K)</td>
<td>( \Delta H^{\circ} ) (kJ mol(^{-1}))</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>298</td>
<td>17.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>308</td>
<td>–5.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>318</td>
<td>–6.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
existing in these four kinds of real water samples. Recovery experiments were carried out by adding standard samples into the real water samples (Table 4). Most of the recoveries were calculated to be more than 90%, confirming the excellent adsorption performance of GO-CCl composite for REE\(^{3+}\) from complicated real water samples.

### 4. Conclusion

In this work, a facile hydrothermal method was successfully conducted to obtain a novel GO-CCl nanocomposite. The relevant characterizations such as FT-IR, Raman spectroscopy, TGA and FE-SEM were carried out to reveal the structural features and surface groups of GO-CCl nanocomposite. The adsorption kinetics, isotherms and thermodynamics of GO-CCl nanocomposite for Yb\(^{3+}\) were investigated in detail. The adsorption performances of GO-CCl composite for REE\(^{3+}\) in real samples including spring water, Xiangjiang River water, Yudai River water and tap water were also studied, and the as-prepared material showed satisfactory adsorption capacity in these complicated water systems. In summary, the proposed GO-CCl composite can be used in the adsorption, removal and enrichment of REE ions from aqueous solutions.

### Acknowledgments

The authors are grateful to the financial support from National Natural Science Foundation of China (Nos. 51674292, 21471163 and 51574118), Provincial Natural Science Foundation of Hunan (No. 2016JJ1023) and Hunan Provincial Science and Technology Plan Project, China (No. 2018TP1003).

### References


Table 4

Analytical recoveries for the determination of La\(^{3+}\), Y\(^{3+}\), Yb\(^{3+}\), Er\(^{3+}\) and Nd\(^{3+}\) in water samples (sorbent = 10 mg, volume = 20 mL, added concentration = 20 mg L\(^{-1}\)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>La(^{3+}) (%)</th>
<th>Y(^{3+}) (%)</th>
<th>Yb(^{3+}) (%)</th>
<th>Er(^{3+}) (%)</th>
<th>Nd(^{3+}) (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spring water</td>
<td>95.28</td>
<td>70.52</td>
<td>88.41</td>
<td>88.69</td>
<td>89.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xiangjiang river</td>
<td>98.74</td>
<td>85.59</td>
<td>91.26</td>
<td>92.55</td>
<td>96.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yudai river</td>
<td>99.15</td>
<td>91.72</td>
<td>89.96</td>
<td>92.32</td>
<td>95.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tap water</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>98.48</td>
<td>88.31</td>
<td>90.91</td>
<td>94.95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>